



**ACTION MINUTES  
ST. HELENA PLANNING COMMISSION  
VINTAGE HALL BOARD ROOM – 2<sup>ND</sup> FLOOR  
465 MAIN STREET, ST. HELENA  
June 21, 2016  
6:00 P.M. REGULAR MEETING**

**1. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**2. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL:**

Chairperson: Sarah Parker

Vice Chair: Grace Kistner

Commissioners: Bobbi Monnette, Tracy Sweeney, Mary Koberstein

Staff Present: Aaron Hecock, Senior Planner, Tom Brown, City Attorney, Victor Carniglia, Contract Planner, Steve Palmer, Director of Public Works, Xinia Gamero, Administrative Assistant.

- 3. PUBLIC FORUM:** This is an opportunity for the public to address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are NOT listed on the agenda. Because of restrictions imposed by the Brown Act, the Commission may not engage in discussion nor take action on matters not described on the agenda. **Please observe the time limit of three minutes.**

Chair Parker opened Public Forum.

No Public Comment received.

Chair Parker closed Public Forum.

**CONSENT ITEMS:** Members of the Commission or the public may ask that any items be considered individually for purposes of considering alternative action, for extended discussion, or for public comment. Unless this is done, one motion may be used to adopt all recommended actions. (Roll Call Vote)

**4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** *June 7, 2016*

- 5. PL16-024:** Design Review Exemption  
**LOCATION:** 1020 Main Street  
**APPLICANT:** Chris Birdwell  
**APN:** 009-090-050  
**CEQA:** Exempt pursuant to Sections 15303

**DESCRIPTION:** *Design Review Exemption requesting Planning Commission approval to construct two 112 square feet storage sheds and a decorative trellis screening these sheds to provide storage for the Southbridge Hotel at 1020 Main Street, Suite 300.*

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:** *Staff recommends that the Planning Commission accept the required findings and approve the design review exemption 1020 Main Street, Suite 300.*

**MOTION:** Commissioner Kistner moved to approve the Consent Calendar as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Monnette and roll call carried by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioners Kistner, Monnette, Koberstein, Sweeney and Parker

NOES: None

ABSENT: None

Chair Parker pulled Public Hearing Item 9 and was heard before Study Session Item 6.

9. **PL16-013:** Design Review  
**LOCATION:** 2225 Palmer Drive  
**APPLICANT:** Jennifer Waddell  
**APN:** 009-690-013  
**CEQA:** Exempt pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15303

**DESCRIPTION:** *The applicant is seeking design review approval to remodel an existing single family home and accessory structure and to construct a new detached garage on the property located at 2225 Palmer Drive in the LR-1A: Low Density Residential district.*

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:** *Staff recommends that the Planning Commission accept the required findings and approve design review for the proposed remodel and new construction at 2225 Palmer Drive.*

Aaron Hecock reported on Item 9.

Chair Parker opened Public Comment.

Nicky Byers addressed the Commission.

Chair Parker closed Public Comment.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Kistner moved that the Planning Commission accept the required findings and approve design review for the proposed remodel and new construction at 2225 Palmer Drive. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Monnette and roll call carried by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioners Kistner, Monnette, Koberstein, Sweeney and Parker

NOES: None

ABSENT: None

## **STUDY SESSION DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

### **6. GENERAL PLAN STUDY SESSION**

**DESCRIPTION:** *The following topics are to be addressed as part of this agenda item, all of which are relevant to the City sponsored General Plan Update, 1) Receive comments from the City Attorney on and discuss as appropriate legal issues raised in comments received to date from the public on the Draft General Plan; 2) Review and discuss Staff responses to General Plan wording changes suggested by “Citizen’s Voice and other members of the public, 3) Review and provide comments on the new wording proposed by staff in the “Introduction” to the General Plan that emphasizes the importance of periodic review, and 4) Verify that the summary of Planning Commission direction to date on the April 2016 Draft General Plan is complete and accurate.*

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:** *Staff recommends the Planning Commission take the following actions:*

- 1. Receive the presentation from the City Attorney concerning legal questions raised by commenters on the April 2016 General Plan, and provide comments/questions as appropriate.*
- 2. Review the various wording changes proposed to the General Plan by Citizen’s Voice and others as summarized in this staff report, while considering the alternate wording recommended by staff to address a number of the issues raised.*
- 3. Provide feedback to staff on the new wording proposed by staff to be added to Chapter 1 of the General to address the importance of the periodic review of the General Plan.*
- 4. Review the summary of Planning Commission comments on the text of the General Plan made by the Commission at the three preceding General Plan Study Sessions, as compiled by staff. Provide feedback to staff on the thoroughness and accuracy of this comment summary.*

Victor Carniglia, Contract Planner, Reported on Item 6..

Tom Brown, City Attorney, addressed the Commission.

Chair Parker opened Public Hearing.

Vicky Bradshaw, Pam Simpson, Doug Barr, Mr. David, Geoff Ellsworth and Lester Hardy addressed the Commission.

Chair Parker closed Public Hearing.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Sweeney moved that the Planning Commission do not accept the addition of the word management to tourism and leave wording as is. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kistner and roll call carried by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioners Sweeney, Kistner and Parker  
NOES: Commissioners Koberstein and Monnette  
ABSENT: None

Chair Parker opened Public Comment.

Pam Simpson, Doug Barr addressed the Commission.

Chair Parker closed Public Comment.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Monnette moved that the Planning Commission add the word tourism to section 2.4. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kistner and roll call carried by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioners Monnette, Koberstein  
NOES: Commissioners Sweeney, Kistner and Parker  
ABSENT: None

Chair Parker opened Public Comment.

Doug Barr addressed the Commission.

Chair Parker closed Public Comment.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Sweeney moved that the Planning Commission move the letter forward without judgement on behalf of Citizen's Voice to the City Council for consideration. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kistner and roll call carried by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioners Sweeney, Kistner, Koberstein Monnette and Parker  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

Victor Carniglia, Contract Planner, addressed the Commission.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Koberstein moved that the Planning Commission approve the new language proposed by staff. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Sweeney and roll call carried by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioners Sweeney, Kistner, Koberstein, Monnette and Parker  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

Chair Parker opened Public Comment.

No Public Comment received.

Chair Parker closed Public Comment.

Chair Parker opened Public Comment.

No Public Comment received.

Chair Parker closed Public Comment.

Chair Parker called for a recess at 7:55 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 8:03 p.m.

Chair Parker opened Public Comment.

Geoff Ellsworth and Mr. David addressed the Commission

Chair Parker closed Public Comment.

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:** Planning Commission directed Contract Planner, Victor Carniglia to work with Mr. David on changes suggested.

Chair Parker opened Public Comment.

No Public Comment received.

Chair Parker closed Public Comment.

Chair Parker opened Public Comment.

Lester Hardy, Geoff Ellsworth and Pam Simpson addressed the Commission.

Chair Parker closed Public Comment.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Sweeney moved that the Planning Commission not include any expression of concern over potential impacts of the wine train stopping and letting off passengers in St. Helena. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kistner and roll call carried by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioners Sweeney, Kistner, Koberstein and Parker

NOES: Commissioner Monnette

ABSENT: None

Chair Parker opened Public Comment.

Geoff Ellsworth, Pam Simpson and Lester Hardy addressed the Commission.

Chair Parker closed Public Comment.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Koberstein moved that the Planning Commission add the words “and tourism” after the words “manage and growth” on section 2.4. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kistner and roll call carried by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioners Sweeney, Kistner, Koberstein, Monnette and Parker

NOES: None

ABSENT: None

## **PUBLIC HEARING:**

### **7. GENERAL PLAN REVISED DRAFT EIR COMMENT PERIOD**

**DESCRIPTION:** *Public Hearing to receive comments on the Revised Draft Environmental Impact Report (RDEIR).*

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:** *No action is required. Responses to all verbal comments received at the June 21, 2016 hearing will be addressed as part of the “Response to Comments” section of the Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR).*

Victor Carniglia reported on Item 7.

Chair Parker opened Public Comment.

Lester Hardy addressed the Commission.

Chair Parker closed Public Comment.

- 8. PL16-023:** Demolition Permit  
**LOCATION:** 1484 & 1486 Sulphur Springs Avenue  
**APPLICANT:** Daniel Davis Inc.  
**APN:** 009-362-024 & 009-362-025  
**CEQA:** Approved Mitigated Negative Declaration

**DESCRIPTION:** *Request for Demolition Permit approval to demolish two single family homes located at 1484 and 1486 Sulphur Springs Road to accommodate finalization of an approved subdivision of the property.*

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:** *Staff recommends that the Planning Commission accept the required findings and approve the demolition permit for 1484 & 1486 Sulphur Springs Avenue.*

Aaron Hecock reported on Item 8.

Chair Parker opened Public Hearing.

Lester Hardy, representing applicant, addressed the Commission.

Chair Parker closed Public Hearing.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Monnette moved that the Planning Commission accept the required findings and approve the demolition permit for 1484 & 1486 Sulphur Springs Avenue. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Koberstein and roll call carried by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioner Monnette, Koberstein, Kistner, Sweeney and Parker

NOES: None

ABSENT: None

9. ~~PL16-013:~~ \_\_\_\_\_ Design Review  
**LOCATION:** \_\_\_\_\_ 2225 Palmer Drive  
**APPLICANT:** \_\_\_\_\_ Jennifer Waddell  
**APN:** \_\_\_\_\_ 009-690-013  
**CEQA:** \_\_\_\_\_ Exempt pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15303

~~**DESCRIPTION:** *The applicant is seeking design review approval to remodel an existing single family home and accessory structure and to construct a new detached garage on the property located at 2225 Palmer Drive in the LR-1A: Low Density Residential district.*~~

~~**RECOMMENDED ACTION:** *Staff recommends that the Planning Commission accept the required findings and approve design review for the proposed remodel and new construction at 2225 Palmer Drive.*~~

~~**MOTION:** Commissioner \_\_\_\_\_ moved that the Planning Commission accept the required findings and approve design review for the proposed remodel and new construction at 2225 Palmer Drive. The motion was seconded by Commissioner \_\_\_\_\_ and roll call carried by the following vote:~~

~~AYES:~~

~~NOES:~~

~~ABSENT:~~

10. **DEPARTMENT REPORT:** This is an opportunity for staff to report on or update the Commission on any relevant matters.

- *General update on Department activities.*

**AGENDA FORCAST:** Attached is a summary document of pending projects and upcoming and items of priority and interest that will be placed on future agendas. This is

also an opportunity for the Commission as a whole to request items be placed on future agendas for discussion. These items should be consistent with, and work to implement adopted Council Goals.

**ADJOURNMENT**: Chair Parker adjourned the meeting at **9:15 p.m.**

APPROVED:

ATTEST:

---

Grace Kistner  
Chair, Planning Commission

---

Noah Housh  
Planning Director